

EPA-PNL-364

Carol Ann Woody  
<carolw@alaskalife.net>  
02/29/2012 03:27 PM

To Bo Boudart, Alaska Center for the Environment the Environment, William Kleindl, Julius Baker, Kirk Schubert, Mary Hattie, David Kaplan, William Yardley, Luki Akelkok, Steve Fleischman Debby Burwen, Representative\_Scott\_Kawasaki, Jim Adams, Mark Smith AFS, Karl Vick, Robin Samuelson, Lynette, Jeff Caulfield, Kevin Kumagai, "Kuhirsekorn@Hotmail.", Sue Mauger, "Info@Bristolbayalliance.", Dan Dunaway, "Rep. Bryce Edgmon", Paul Morley, David Trimm, Ashley Reed, Jud Monroe, Dan Bogan, "Jack A. Stanford, Ph.D.", Joel Hard, Tom&ReneeOConner, Jessica Dryden, Randy\_J\_Brown, Tom Kline, Alex Prud'homme, Laine Welch, Peter and Joy, Todd Radenbaugh, pheyno, Channing Wilson, Michael Olyeska, Tom Banks, Nancy Wainwright, Margie Bauman, Cindy Hartmann, Geoff York, Greg Ruggerone, Bruce Switzer, Michael Davis, Travis Rummel, Gail, Liz Snyder, Dan\_Young, "Kari Huus (MSNBC-JV)", Lesil McGuire, Corey Rich, Mike Tranel, Aaron Fetter, Jeanne Schaaf, Nikos Pastos, jerry liboff, David Shurtleff, George Jacko, Pete Andrew, Susan O'Neal, Roger Flynn, Michael Melford, Jim Nations, Bob Shavelson, Mike Spear, Mary\_McBurney, STU Smith, Jack Woody, MichelleV Davis, Marcus Geist, Nanci Morris Lyon, Vic Scheibert, Nancy Dahlstrom, Kurt Mutchler, John, Karen Gillis, Maribeth Brown, ben knight, DANIEL RINELLA, Bob, Ann Maest, Kristina Ramstad, Pinky, Lia Parker, Steve Corey, David Aplin, Joseph Spaeder, Tatiana Askoak, Brian Litmans, Jeff Opdyke, Trawicki\_Cindy, Daniel Duane, Andria Agli, Pat Flatley, RLBritton, Robert Heyano, Stu Levit, "David E. Brailey", Mike Ward, Penny and Chris Habicht, Marianne Grant, Warner Lew, njszarzi, "Tmeacham@Gci.", Daniel Schindler, Carol Reynolds, Stewart Grant, warren, Kevin Davis, "James B. Reynolds", Jim Haynes, "Hughes. Bob", Phil North, John\_Trawicki, Jill Flanders\_Crosby, Kari Huss, Ralph Andersen, Dave Montgomery, Karen and Pat Murphy, Tildenthomas, Hig, Charlotte Balluta, Willie Dixson, George Hornberger, Scott Brennan, Fawn Silas, Mark\_Lisac, Harry Rich, Joel Natwick, Marie Bowers, Ann Harding, Kelvin Doyle, Debi Mclean, Margaret Williams, Lance Holter, Michael Webster, Bryan Honkytonk, "Ted (DFG) Otis", Kim Hutchinson, Mark Wipfli, Mary Lochner, Lucinda Tear, Brian and Ellen Lance, "Susan L. Flensburg", Mark and Mary Emery, Trevor Fulton, roquedlg, Jim Stratton, "Mike. Fedorko", Karen\_Evanoff, Daniel Chythlook, Joe Margraf, Karen Joynt, Terry Hoeffler, Rohn & Lori Nelson, Mark Vinsel, Lance Trasky, Krystyna U Wolniakowski, Kelly Harrell, John Tobin, Alannah Hurley, Mike Pawlawski, Dave Meyer Private, Louie Flora, Andrew White, Buck Mangipane, Stan Hermens, Stephen\_Fried, Page Spencer, "Jim P. Welch", Art Hackney, Tom Yocom, Patrick Farrell, Chudabob, Joe&Kathy Spicola, C&G Coray, "DeeDee Bennis, (Pinkys,Sister)", "Mat Cannava, MD", Thomas Yocom, Neil McCarthy, Kendra Zamzow, Cash Joyce, Frank Woods, Courtenay Carty, Everett Thompson, andrew metz, Emilie Otis


cc

bcc

Subject Fwd: From Greenwire -- MINING: Documents show regulators' frustration with Pebble project

Carol Ann Woody, Ph.D.  
Fisheries Research and Consulting, LLC  
[www.fish4thefuture.com](http://www.fish4thefuture.com)  
[carolw@alaskalife.net](mailto:carolw@alaskalife.net)  
907.242.3496

**Confidentiality Notice:** This communication may contain attorney-client privileged or other confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe that you may have received this communication in error, you should not read it. Instead, please reply to the sender indicating that fact and delete the copy you received. You may not print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use the information.



**An E&E Publishing Service**

**MINING: Documents show regulators' frustration with Pebble project** *(Monday, February 27, 2012)*

**Manuel Quinones, E&E reporter**

Some government regulators working on the massive Pebble gold and copper mine in Alaska expressed frustration about the company's lack of transparency and voiced concern about the project's potential environmental impacts, according to newly released documents.

The dozens of emails, letters and memos from several state and federal agencies were obtained by *Greenwire* through the anti-Pebble group Trout Unlimited, which filed a Freedom of Information Act request for access. They detail rising tensions over the project dating back almost a decade.

"[Pebble Limited Partnership's] response to the draft Guiding Principles document appears to give notice that they intend to do only the minimum legally required to gain the permits required to develop the mine and associated infrastructure," Ted Otis, a biologist for the Alaska Department of Fish and Game, wrote in a 2009 email.

"I personally find that to be disconcerting, given the 'WE WILL DO NO HARM' doctrine PLP has long preached in their [public relations] campaigns," Otis wrote.

Pebble Limited Partnership -- a joint venture of mining giants Anglo American PLC and Northern Dynasty Minerals Ltd. -- has spent several hundred million dollars to date on research, exploration and preparation for an eventual permitting process (*Greenwire*, Feb. 9).

But regulators complained about not having enough input into some of that research and about Pebble's willingness to share information. They also chafed about the technical working group process established to promote cooperation.

"I am aware that EPA and other agencies share a growing level of dissatisfaction with the adequacy of the TWG process as a whole," said a 2009 letter from U.S. EPA's Alaska operations office. "Our experience has been increased internal staff frustration over [Pebble Limited Partnership's] willingness to both acknowledge and incorporate our input on various PLP products and plans."

A 2009 email from U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service biologist Phil Brna said, "I do agree with PLPs assertion that the recent TWG meetings have been increasingly antagonistic and confrontational, but I suggest this is largely the result of PLPs unwillingness to share information with agencies or to respond to our specific requests."

The documents also shed light on bureaucratic squabbling, with disagreements over the content of meeting minutes and the value of getting involved so early in the process. Despite years of work by numerous agencies, the mine has yet to formally enter the permitting process.

"We have dedicated these resources based upon assurances that a project, design, and data would be forthcoming to make the TWG a productive process," said a 2009 letter from the Army Corps of Engineers, in which the agency announced it would no longer participate on the technical working group.

Early regulatory involvement stems from Pebble's potentially becoming one of the largest mining projects in the world. The company says the site, located in southwest Alaska near Bristol Bay and its valuable salmon fishery, contains more than 80 billion pounds of copper and more than 107 million ounces of gold.

In a 2005 letter, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service said, "We remain concerned that the proposed studies are not of sufficient scope to establish a true baseline to adequately assess changes in the environment which may result from the project over time."

Pebble has also been working with regulators over smaller exploration and infrastructure permits. In a 2010 letter, the Alaska Department of Fish and Game chided the company over a water use violation.

"Our investigation revealed that in 2009," the letter said, "Pebble withdrew water from five locations that were not reviewed for permit requirements by the Division of Habitat."

### **Pebble fights back**

Pebble spokesman Mike Heatwole said that many of the meetings and information releases were an effort by Pebble to promote transparency in the process. He notes that the company has released information before being legally required to do so.

"We continue to work on this and the release of our environmental studies is a first step," he said in an email. "It should also be noted that we have released the [environmental] studies pre-permitting and have done so because we recognize the public interest in our project."

Earlier this month, the company released an environmental baseline document, which it calls "one of the most extensive environmental studies program ever conducted for a natural resource project in Alaska."

The released documents showed that Pebble wanted reasons and justifications for agency information requests. The company also felt that a document from regulators was "lecturing and commanding" and did not promote dialogue.

And in a March 2009 document, Pebble repeated an often-expressed caveat: "We wish to affirm that the Pebble Project remains in a pre-permitting phase and as such, it is to be expected that the project design has not been fully developed yet."

***Want to read more stories like this?***

**[Click here](#)** to start a free trial to E&E -- the best way to track policy and markets.

### **About Greenwire**

Greenwire is written and produced by the staff of E&E Publishing, LLC. The one-stop source for those who need to stay on top of all of today's major energy and environmental action with an average of more than 20 stories a day, Greenwire covers the complete spectrum, from electricity industry restructuring to Clean Air Act litigation to public lands management. Greenwire publishes daily at Noon.



E&E Publishing, LLC  
122 C St., Ste. 722, NW, Wash., D.C. 20001.  
Phone: 202-628-6500. Fax: 202-737-5299.  
[www.eenews.net](http://www.eenews.net)

All content is copyrighted and may not be reproduced or retransmitted without the express consent of E&E Publishing, LLC. [Click here](#) to view our privacy policy.